Scaling Up Health Innovations in India: Lessons Learnt

Poonam Muttreja, Executive Director, Population Foundation of India,
Rajani R. Ved, Advisor, National Health Systems Resource Center
April 16, 2012
Why don’t pilots/innovations get scaled?

- Despite a plethora of “innovations”, why do we have persistently poor development indicators?
- Why does scaling up a pilot not produce the intended outcomes?
- How do we learn from “failed” scaling up of pilots?
- What are the key structural barriers to scaling up health interventions?
The Scaling Up Management Framework

Step 1: Developing a scaling up plan
Task 1: Creating a Vision for scaling up
Task 2: Defining the model and assessing Scalability - What?
Task 3: Filling in the gaps/Modifying the model

Step 2: Establish the preconditions for scaling up
Task 5: Legitimization: advocating for the general issue
Task 6: Advocacy for Adoption
Task 7: Realigning and Mobilizing Resources

Step 3: Implement the Scaling up process
Task 8: Strengthening Organizations
Task 9: Coordinating Action
Task 10: Tracking Performance and Maintaining Momentum
Application of the SUM Framework

- Creating an intermediary agency to support the process of scaling up
  Population Foundation for India

Pilots supported:
- Home based New Born care, (SEARCH)
- Increasing age of first conception/child spacing (Institute of Health Management, Pachod) (IHMP)
- Community-based Health Insurance (SEWA)
- NGO Management of Public Primary Health Care Centers (Karuna Trust)
- Multiskilling Medical Officers in the provision of Emergency Obstetric Services – Federation of Obstetricians and Gynaecologists) (FOGSI)
- Improving maternal health through improving decentralized governance, (Community Health Care Management Initiative (CHCMI))
- Scan of government led innovations- MOHFW Directory of innovations, 2007
- Case studies of scaling up: Community Health Workers, Safe Abortion,
- Training and dissemination
Scalability Assessment

- **Credible**: based on sound evidence or espoused by respected persons or institutions
- **Observable**: to ensure that results are tangible
- **Relevant**: for addressing persistent problems;
- **Relative advantage** over existing practices
- **Easy to transfer and adopt** within large scale systems (government) and compatible with the existing users established norms, resources, and processes;
- **System Readiness**: to ensure adoption
- **Able to be tested** without committing the large scale implementing agency to adopting the model, when results are not yet clear.
- **Funding** is likely to be available for the scaling up or can be mobilized
Key Learning

- Technical components of the model are emphasized over the organizational and institutional requirements for scaling up.
- Nature of evidence required for scaling up of complex social sector interventions needs to go beyond pilot based Randomized Control Trials.
- Understanding of socio-political context is critical for scaling up.
- Ownership and responsibility of scaling up process: requires collaboration and boundary spanning between organizations.
Key Learning (cont’d.)

- Several models for one intervention- competition and political maneuvering
- Adaptation to local circumstances as important as fidelity to model; finding the balance is key
- Scaling up components from pilot models selectively may not reproduce results; identify and retain ALL essential components
- Assessment of “fit” with current policy priorities- advocacy
- Congruence of scaling up strategy with the capabilities of adopting organizations
- Managing change in adopting or partner organizational capability needs to be backed by sufficient resources
Key Learning (cont’d.)

- Advocacy requires intensive effort and competence - needs to reach implementers
- System capacity is not infinite; - needs additional resources
- Contextual innovations are a part of scaling up
- Monitoring scaling up improves outcomes
Scaling Up: The Path Forward

- Creating an intermediary for scaling up
- Building scalability into the design of pilots from the very beginning
- Inculcate scaling up approach and skills within resource and training organizations to assess system readiness/strengthen organizations to go to scale
- Task shifting and Multi-skilling to overcome human resource shortages
- Financial resources for scaling up should include investment for the scaling up process
- Expand partnerships: PRI, NGOs, Community Collectives, academic and research agencies
- Incentivization (monetary and non monetary) is key to successful scaling up
- Five key steps- Strengthen Decentralization, Expand partnerships, Support Capacity Building, Bring rigor into Monitoring, Learning and Evaluation, and Stimulate Innovation