



## HUMAN DEVELOPMENT TOWARDS BRIDGING INEQUALITIES PROJECT

### STAKEHOLDER CONSULTATION AND FIRST NATIONAL STEERING COMMITTEE MEETING

23 January 2012, Venue: Viceregal, The Claridges, New Delhi



Empowered lives.  
Resilient nations.

Shri. Tuhin K. Pandey, Joint Secretary, State Plans Division, Planning Commission - Welcoming the participants, Mr. Pandey informed the participants about the launch of the project "Human Development: Towards Bridging Inequalities". Acknowledging the previous collaboration on human development, he mentioned that the preparation of state and district level Human Development reports has triggered public policy and discourse on government priorities. He emphasized that the launch of this phase coincides with launch of the XII Five Year Plan and noted that the objectives of the project complimented that of the XII Five Year Plan, particularly its focus on disparities and inequalities, be it geographical, social, or rural-urban.

Mr. Pandey then elaborated on each of the project components and urged state government to identify the initiatives that can be taken up by states. He urged states to come up with a comprehensive state led programme on human development and to use the Planning Commission-UNDP project funds to complement the state's overall plan.

Mr. Patrice Coeur-Bizot, Resident Coordinator UN and Resident Representative UNDP - Mr. Coeur-Bizot welcomed the participants on behalf of UNDP and thanked the Planning Commission for its support during the UNDAF preparation. He deliberated on India's strengths on human development reporting at the national and state levels and thus far and highlighted that the key element of the new programme would be the focus on analyzing persistent inequalities.

Mr. Pronab Sen, Senior Adviser, Planning Commission - Dr. Sen noted that a project of this kind should have come 15 years ago. The challenge being faced is that Human Development Reports are being looked on primarily as descriptions of societies and descriptions of systems. However, at the heart of all planning is an understanding of the human behavior. However, what is needed is to understand how people behave when faced with certain impulses, certain opportunities and certain forces. In the absence of that understanding it is not possible to device public interventions, whether in the policy space or in the space. That is really what this particular phase of the human development work in India will have to be.

HDRs have got the descriptive framework in place, but along with that descriptive framework we need to be able to build up the correlates of the human condition which inform us about behaviour, how people react which could inform programme design. While it is generally believed that there is poor implementation of schemes because of which outcomes are not being achieved. However, the programmes are probably poorly designed because of the pre-conceived notions that the planners have. This is something that need to be addressed.

This will pose a huge demand on the statistical systems and may require systems that rely on participatory methods and at a micro level.

Ms. Sumeeta Banerji, Assistant Country director, UNDP - informed the participants about the salient features of the project (see attached presentation). The first phase of the collaboration focused on preparation of state HDRs, whereas the second phase which ended in December 2009 focused on a broad range of activities to strengthen state plans for human development. A number of evaluation conducted during the last two years strongly recommended that human

development is UNDP's niche in India and there should be a dedicated focus on human development in UNDP's programme.

The project "Human development towards bridging inequalities" focuses on analytical work at the state level on inequalities. The overall objective for this phase would be to influence national and state policies, to improve human development outcomes through research and advocacy. The scope would include another round of state human development reports and districts human development reports, but with the strong focus on issues of persistent inequality at the state levels -- who are the different groups that are marginalized where are they located. Strengthening statistical system for monitoring human development outcomes would be another important component of the programme. Research on issues of human development and inclusion, including an understanding bottlenecks and implementations of schemes would be supported. Other important components of the programme will be capacity development, strengthening advocacy efforts, analysis of fiscal policies to see what is adequacy of fiscal policies to be able to develop human development challenges at state levels and lastly using community monitoring tools to be able to identify how the people perceive the achievement of their own human development outcomes, the access to public service delivery and how these bottom-up approaches to identifying issues and concerns can feed into programme design.

Presentations from States –

**1. Dr. Aranbinda Ghosh, ATI West Bengal and Ms Sayanti, Department of Development Planning, West Bengal**

- The key highlights of the SSPHD project were –
  - Preparation of DHDR served as a platform bringing together academicians, district officers of various departments, and members of the district planning committees. DHDRs were used as a tool for district planning.
  - Capacity building of officials was done on a large scale.
  - A separate head of account was opened in 24 departments on women specific programme.
  - A collation of Acts, rules relating to women has been done in local language specially targeted at PRIs.
  - A study has been conducted to measure the efficiency of delivery system of government's scheme at gram panchayats level.
  - Advocacy and capacity development through films, posters has been promoted.
  - A study focusing on 2 districts to study data flows and identify gaps. The purpose was to strengthen the statistical system for timely collection and reporting of district and local level indicators of human development. To bring about the uniformity in collection of data we have published a book in local language so that the indicators should be uniformed.
  - Natural resource data management system (NRDMS) is operational in almost all the districts of the state. The centres are expected to provide valuable data for preparation of DHDRs which will lead to realistic district planning and facilitate to find out the inequalities and to address them.
- Suggestions for the future –
  - HDRs should be not only in district level but in sub-district as well as in city municipalities whatever so that the HD level data can be more and more precise. DHDRs should be done at regular intervals.
  - There is limited capacity at the state and district level to undertake analysis on inequalities. This need to be augmented.

- Standardisation of methodology for computing HDIs so as to be able to track progress.
- Linking district plans and HD is essential.
- Process documentation for the preparation of HDR must be done.

## 2. **Shri. Vijay Kumar, Additional Chief Secretary, Government of Tamil Nadu**

- Tamil Nadu has undertaken preparation of 8 DHDRs which was followed up by dissemination. The larger question is that of the state putting in budgets for human development.
- At the institutional level, Tamil Nadu has the State Planning Commission, the Department of economics and statistics (which is anchoring the ISSP), the Department for evaluation and applied research for quantitative data collection
- The focus of the state government is on habitation based planning and to provide rural areas with facilities that are similar urban areas.
- The priorities for the state include focusing on the disadvantaged persons either by disability or by old age or by various medical conditions etc. so those people are also supported by extensive social welfare programmes in the states. A lot of money has been spent in the budget on this aspect and that is what it makes for inclusive growth.
- Disasters have a huge impact on human development and we need to be able to measure the impact of disasters on human development.
- The qualitative measurements and use of tools such as PAHELI are extremely critical and the state looks forward to implementing such tools.

## 3. **Dr. R.V. Singh, Special Secretary, Government of Odisha**

- Odisha was the 9<sup>th</sup> state to have released its state HDR and has 5 district level HDRs.
- Availability of data was a major constraint in preparation of state and district HDRs.
- In order to better insitutionalise the HD process, the Government of Odisha established a poverty and human development monitoring agency within the planning department.
- Odisha has also taken huge strides on district planning and it is the only state which had prepared district plans for all 30 districts from 2008-09 continuously and in 2010-11. A district planning and monitoring unit has been put directly under the charge of collector who is the chairperson and also the member secretary of district planning committee to support district planning process.
- The next set of district plans will have human development as their focus. The state intends to prepare DHDRs for all the 30 districts.
- Odisha has implemented PAHELI which provides a people' perspective on outcomes and implementation of government schemes. The reports are being finalized.
- Since the next phase of the project focusses on inequalities, it must be understood that for states that are at the lower levels of attainments, this is not a very encouraging exercise and there are political sensitivities that have to be addressed.

## 4. **Sikkim**

- UNDP and the Government of Sikkim have a long standing partnership on human development reporting which has led to capacity development within the state.
- The Government of Sikkim has initiated process of preparation of the second HDR with its own resources. Background papers have been commissioned.
- The state would welcome technical collaboration in terms of seeking best practices of other HDRs and Sikkim being located in between Nepal and Bhutan so HDRs these countries would be very relevant.
- The government would like to have more information on initiatives such as PAHELI.

- It would be useful to develop research analysis capability in-house and new academic institutes are coming in the state.

## 5. MOSPI

- The Ministry is implementing the Indian Statistical Strengthening Project (ISSP) project. Better coordination is needed between the Planning Departments and the Directorates of Economics and Statistics to strengthen the statistical infrastructure in the state.
- From a human development [perspective, it is important to have quantitative as well as qualitative data. Eg – on use of facilities.
- The methodologies you are having to assess the human development outcomes it should be very carefully and very cautiously taken into not only qualitative aspect on which I already said you need to improve the system to get basic data but on the qualitative that the real problem that's the real outcome we are looking at. The methodologies should be shared at a platform and discussed to arrive at standard methodology taking into concentration merits and demerits but also it becomes a kind of exercise the assessment evaluation exercise finally comes out for different states it is having some certain benchmark and certain comparability there otherwise states start adopting their own practices we don't know state human development indicators reports to what extent it is comparable these are some of these issues .

*JS(SP) – This project is going to complement the ISSP and not replicate it . We ought to have systems of releasing data on an annual basis on a given date. Data should be comparable across states and over time. Statistical system is the key to planning is the key to the evaluation therefore we agree certain set of indicators for example quality indicators*

## 6. Mr. Madheswaran, Advisor, Karnataka

- Karnataka achieved GSDP growth rate of 8% in 2010-11 the state's per capita income has risen sharply from 2001 to 2011. The social sector expenditure has also increased in the same period. Literacy rates have gone up from 56% in 1991 to 76% in 2011. While overall enrolment rates have gone up, in upper primary school enrolment, Karnataka's position has slipped from 3<sup>rd</sup> to 7<sup>th</sup> position. When it come into health indicator infant mortality rate has come down from 77 to 38 live births in 2010 and the maternal mortality ratio of course has also come down from 228 to 178 per 1 lakh life births our life expectancy birth is 65.3 . Overall sex ratio it has slightly improved to 968 from 960 in 1991
- The state was the first to set up human development division in planning department thereby institutionalizing human development concern in the state planning process. It prepares a separate chapter on HD in the economic survey and state annual plan.
- State human development reports have been prepared in 1999-2005 and district human development reports have been prepared for 4 districts in 2008. Standardisation of methodology is a challenge.
- A Karnataka evaluation authority has been set up and one of its aim is to strengthen human development issues. Methodology for preparation of DHDR has been standardized. A training programme for DHDR teams has been implemented with the support of the ATI.
- The state has a vision 2020 -- the outcome based budgeting is not there, so an outcome based budgeting for HD needs to be undertaken.
- Other areas of future collaboration include advocacy for sensitization and creating awareness about HD issues, research studies to address social and geographical disparities, impact of fiscal corrections on human development, research on schemes to address bottlenecks constraints in implementation, capacity development and HD oriented analysis and use of community monitoring tools.

## **7. Principal Secretary, Madhya Pradesh**

- Madhya Pradesh was the first state to have prepared a state level HDR and we have also prepared district level HDRs.
- The Government of Madhya Pradesh strives to reach out to the last person including those people that belong to the de-notified tribes. There have been a number of initiatives promoting status of women, notable among these are the “ladli lakshmi yojana” where the girl child protection has become institutionalized. The education of girl child has been incentivised.
- Decentralised planning is being promoted and every department has an opportunity of having a look at what exactly a village wants. Supporting this is the decision to digitise maps through the satellite imagery.
- The state ranks very low on human development indicators such as IMR and MMR, but given the focused attention, this is going to change.
- The new project will help us to do reviews of various flagship schemes and to plan out ways in which the state can improve its performance.

## **8. Kevelino Angami, Nagaland**

- After the preparation of the State HDR, the state government undertook the preparation of three DHDR's and six thematic reports and a gender budgeting document. This is now being circulated to all the departments so that they can use it as a guide. The government had also set up a task force to learn about the good practices on gender empowerment in other countries as well as in other states. A pilot taskforce has already gone to Singapore and Malaysia to learn about the practices in women empowerment. The capacity building programme on gender and human development issues is now being institutionalised in the calendar of training programme of the ATI and SIRD.
- The study of Statistical systems identified gaps in the system and recommendation for bridging the gaps. A software for online registration of births and deaths at the district level has been developed. But this has not been able to take off because of the infrastructure problem at the district level, but we hope that in the coming days we will be able to commission it.
- Then, this project has enabled us to lay down the framework for district level reporting and district planning and development boards are to formulate the district plans. Capacity building programs and sensitization workshops at the district level. And while in other state advocacy may not be required, in a state like Nagaland, this is essential.
- The state has initiated the process for institutionalizing human development concerns in the state planning process. The instruction to all the departments is that they have to have a component for human development in their plan document. One challenge that the state is facing is availability of data.
- Nagaland is using the communitisation process for data collection at the grassroots level. The need is to develop capacity at that level for data collection and to incentivise the process.

## **9. Government of Maharashtra**

- The Government of Maharashtra has decided to prepare HDRs every year.
- For focused intervention on human development, after the release of the state HDR, 25 backward talukas were identified which have now been expanded to 125 talukas based on percentage of rural BPL families and percentage rural female literacy. Thirteen schemes (6 schemes from education sector, 3 from health sector and 4 income related schemes) are implemented in these 125 talukas. This year we have been allocated funds of Rs. 421 crore for implementation of this programmes.

- YASHADA is anchoring preparation of the state HDR. The ambition is to prepare block level indices. However, owing to lack of data, this has not been easy and we are discussing whether or not to present the findings in the HDR. There is a definite need to strengthen the statistical systems and to build capacity of state officials on HD analysis.

Additionally, YASHADA would like to undertake research on themes such as migration which is intrinsically linked to HD. Tools such as PAHELi need to be implemented as a form of community monitoring.

- The state has constituted two committees at state level. One is to monitor human development program under the chairmanship of our honorable Deputy Chief Minister. Second, Steering Committee to review the work of HD report and it is chaired by Principal Secretary Planning. Apart from that we also propose that with the help of UNDP and Planning Commission, we can have training programs or workshops for our district level officers who are directly involved in implementing the schemes for Human development.

## **10. Gujarat**

- A directorate of HD has been established to monitor HD activities at the state level.
- A total of 2000 officials have been trained through 70 training programmes at the state and district level on HD challenges in the state.
- The state government is focusing on development at the block level.
- State's experience on DHDR preparation has been mixed – ownership at the district level is a challenge as also the different framework adopted by various institutions.

Session Chair: It is to be noted that human development is more important than human development reports. On the issue of standardization, while it is important to have a core set of analysis, it is important to give flexibility to states and districts.

## **11. Himachal Pradesh**

- One of the most important activities under the project has been the collection of data at the panchayat level. The state has been implementing a programme for backward Panchayats since 1985 in 551 panchayats. The data collection exercise revealed that only 11 panchayats were backward on the indicator.
- One of the biggest challenges that the state faces is the availability of experts for undertaking the analysis.

Session Chair: It is extremely important to use local resources and experts for human development analysis. The process itself needs to develop capacities.

## **12. Assam**

- Building on the past work done, the state government has initiated the process of preparation of the second state HDR – this will be based on primary data collected through survey of 10% of the villages.
- Process for getting a methodology approved is underway. A state level committee with members from concerned department under chairmanship of chief secretary of Assam is set up to guide the process. A core committee under the chairmanship of principal secretary, planning department for monitoring of day to day activity has been established. A nodal officer from concerned department is to be selected for each district. Themes covered under the HDR would include social progress, economics, efficiency, equity, participation in freedom, sustainability, human security.

### **13. TISS**

- In the last 7-8 years, human development has been mainstreamed in all its curricular in the diploma courses that have been introduced afresh. UNDP has funded a curriculum development program with TISS through which we are now going to initiate a PG diploma in HD social accountability.
- TISS has been part of micro planning exercise for over 20 backward districts of Maharashtra.
- Given the fact that even the census report in 2011 have shown that urbanization is going to be a serious phenomenon which is coming in, TISS is going to be focusing extensively on urban poverty beginning with a ward level initiative in Mumbai.
- In next 2 years we will also be going to launch an M.Phil program in HD, if we could get some funding for in terms of fellowship such that we get dedicated trained professionals who focus on orientation and come out with hard core assessment techniques.

**14. NIPFP (Tapas Sen):** While it is well acknowledged that there is a strong correlation between economic and human development, the differential impacts of centrally sponsored schemes actually beg for state level studies. They require state level studies as to why is that the same thing works in some states and it does not work in some other. Also this kind of work has to be done in terms of individual state because by definition these are state specific factors which are actually at work which allow some state to take advantage of some scheme very well, whereas it does not allow some other state to do that.

### **15. MOSPI**

- Since the project has a six year period, it gives us an opportunity to draw long term as well as short term plans. In the short-term, mechanisms for arriving at indicators relevant for HDRs at various level could be devised. In the longer term the need is statistical capacity building in order to cater to the needs of future – to link it up with ISSP, Finance Commission.
- We also need to keep abreast of the new indices that are coming up – the HDR itself has proposed new indices. We can continue with the old set of indices and at the same time look at data requirement for the new indices. The OECD has a different index for measuring gender inequality. And this index – the SIGI – tries to understand the human and societal constraints that affect gender relations in a society. Since the HDI project is also focusing on inequalities, we need to have measures for different types of inequalities – gender, social groups, urban-rural etc.
- Synchronization of concept, definition and terms is essential to have comparable results.

### **16. Ms. Caitlin Wiesen (Country Director, UNDP)**

Highlight a few of the issues that came up in some of the presentation in terms of requests and issues to bear in mind as we move forward.

- First, is the issue of standardization of tools that came up across many of the other groups, the need to have a core standardization of tools, advisory services and also have available a national level pool of resources that can be drawn down on as and when required.
- Second, is that the next generation of the human development reports need to be more closely related to the planning processes, some these happened and there a few good examples here as planning processes as well as fiscal and budgetary processes and these very important moving forward.
- Thirdly, the issues of capacity building and capacity development came up and this needs to be one of the critical dimensions we need to undertake in the third face and need working on the governments and institutions to ensure that we develop centre's of

excellence and critical mass of master trainers and capacities are also required to calculate inequalities need to be addressed

- The fourth area to highlight is area of statistics -- we need to have mechanisms to generate reliable data across the districts and every year. So looking at the periodicity as well as the key dimension and standards to set for a few set of indicators... in terms of assessment what are the key indicators that we want for tracking human development outcomes across the country that are comparable across districts and benchmarks need to be developed and then certain key dimensions that are unique to the states.
- Fifthly there were issues discussed related to research and really strengthen and focusing on human development outcomes including fiscal option would also be useful, this is very important.
- Sixthly was looking at institutional mechanisms and the importance of mapping the variety institutions mechanism that exist for the development of human development. Taking the human development work forward from reports to the planning process to the budgetary and fiscal and the different permutations in different states and they can learn from one another and this is an extremely important undertaking.
- Seventh is looking at some of the innovative models that were shared by different states for promoting human developments and looking at mapping those and looking how we can better share practices across the states in terms of policies developed. In this context it may be very useful to link with national and state level innovations councils.
- Finally the eight one is looking for an interactive learning platform for human development and establishing one virtual one and in person for interacting face to face so that we can have an on-going active exchange on human development, sharing best practices, questions that may be emerging and there are also common issues, shared issues and themes. Various themes like migration, on how are these people treated, or treatment of common ecosystems like the Himalayas and the mountain regions on how are these being treated by different states. So this another broad area that needs to be outlined in terms of interactive learning,

- 17. Ms. Ritu Mathur, UNDP:** As mentioned earlier, the total budget for the project is USD 5.5 million of which approx. USD 800,000 is earmarked for 2012. As has been stated, this should not be a standalone proposal but should be embedded in the states own work on promoting human development. The broad scope of the project includes preparation of HDRs, strengthening of statistical system, capacity building, advocacy, analysis of fiscal policy and use community monitoring tools.

**Session Chair: We are in the month of January and we request states to send us a proposal by February so that work can begin immediately. (Action: all states)**

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks.